

**Syllabus**  
**PT 154a Comparative Psychoanalysis, Part One**  
**D. Gilhooley     Fall 2020**

**Monday 1:30-3:30**  
**NYGSP: 2 Credits**

**Course Description:**

Since the first decade of the 20th century, a range of ideas about the fundamentals of psychoanalytic practice has emerged, leading to corresponding shifts in the theories that have been developed to account for the differences in emphasis, and also, in some cases, for elements of the experience itself that differ from what Freud laid out and described originally. The exploration of the differences between groups or schools of analysis, whether substantive or procedural, will be the subject matter of this course. It will also provide the students with a timeline or history of the development of psychoanalysis.

Often, debates in the field have emerged around the question of what groups of patients can be treated psychoanalytically. For instance, while some schools consider psychotic patients to be outside the scope of psychoanalytic treatment, other schools have produced considerable research on psychosis, its manifestations, and suitable analytic technique. Similarly, different ways of understanding and treating neurotic and non-neurotic patients will serve as points of departure. We will study the following approaches: Freudian, Ferenczian, Kleinian, independent object relational, American ego psychological, self-psychological, interpersonal/relational, Modern, Lacanian, and intersubjective. Particular attention will be given to concepts essential to clinical practice, such as resistance, transference, countertransference, interpretation, emotional communication, the analytic relationship, and the cure.

**Method of Instruction:**

The instructor will lead discussion of assigned readings, concepts, and class process. Each week students will be assigned to present the week's readings.

**Objectives:**

The student will be able to:

- compare and contrast theoretical and clinical approaches of different schools of psychoanalytic thought;
- place Modern Psychoanalysis within the broad context of psychoanalysis, know its origins, and discuss its similarities to and differences from other schools of thought; and
- employ psychoanalytic terminology such as conflict and deficit, trauma and wish, drive derivative, internalized objects, unconscious fantasy, projective identification, objective countertransference, ego defense, regression and adaptation, insight and corrective emotional experience.

## Course Requirements:

1. **Class attendance:** Students are expected to attend all classes. Credit will not be given to students who have more than two absences. Notification of an intended absence is expected prior to the class that will be missed.
2. **Class preparation:** Students will be expected to study the required readings before class and be prepared to discuss them.
3. **Class presentation:** Three times during the semester, each student will give an oral presentation of that week's assigned reading.
4. **A written log** (approximately 250 words by email) is to be completed for each class meeting and emailed at least a day before the next class meeting. **Instructor's email:** dangilhooley@yahoo.com

A log is a private communication to the instructor comprising:

1. thoughts, feelings, and reactions from the previous class regarding course content and observation of class dynamics
2. a short critique of the assigned reading for the following class
3. for the final log, a self-evaluation of how you met the course requirements

Questions and comments from the logs may serve as a springboard for class discussion.

5. **Final paper:** Due the end of exam period. The paper should compare the theoretical and clinical approach of Modern Psychoanalysis with one or more psychoanalytic schools.

It should include the following:

1. A description and definition of the aspects that will be compared.
2. An account of what makes these aspects relevant.
3. A description of similarities and differences of these aspects in different schools of psychoanalysis.
4. A reflection on the positions described, including, if possible (i.e. if the student has clinical experience) their application to a clinical case.
5. Reference to at least two sources on the current reading list and one further source not on the reading list.
6. Appropriate use of subject specific vocabulary.
7. Written in APA format, about 10 pages in length.

A paper that is well-developed in all of the above areas will receive a **Pass**. A paper that is incompletely developed in some of the above areas, and/or has poorly integrated relevant developmental theories will receive a **Low Pass**. A paper that is incompletely developed in most areas and/or does not meet basic graduate level standards for written work will be returned to the student for improvement in order to receive credit.

**Elements of Evaluation:** Class participation, attendance, quality of writing in the logs and in the final paper.

**Grading:** Students may receive a Pass (P), Low Pass (LP), Incomplete (I), or No Credit (NC). Students are evaluated on the basis of attendance, class participation and the ability to understand, integrate and communicate material from the readings and class discussions. This understanding is demonstrated in classroom discussion and by the quality of writing in the logs and in the term paper.

**For a grade of “Pass”**

- Miss no more than two class meetings.
- Demonstrate understanding of the course subject matter in class.
- Submit 12 logs.
- Demonstrate understanding of the course subject matter in the logs.
- Submit assignments on time.
- A clear and well-organized presentation to the class of the assigned reading.
- The final paper covers items one through four, described above.
- Subject specific vocabulary is used correctly.
- APA format is used appropriately.
- The paper is at least eight pages long, without the reference page.

**For a grade of “Low Pass”**

- Miss no more than two class meetings.
- Submit 12 logs.
- One or more of the following are present:
  - Minimal participation in class
  - Problematic participation in class
- Minimal understanding of the course subject matter demonstrated in class, in the individual presentation, and in the logs.
- All assignments are completed but some are submitted late.
- The final paper has one or more of these issues:
  - The material fails to cover adequately one of the items 1 through 4.
  - The paper cites only one source or fails to include an outside source for item 2.
  - Vocabulary is used incorrectly.
  - The paper is less than 7 pages long, or is without the reference page.
  - The paper fails to follow appropriate APA format.
  - The paper is submitted after the due date.

**For a grade of “Incomplete”**

- Acceptable written work is not submitted by the last class meeting of the semester.

**For a grade of “No Credit”**

- Acceptable written work is not submitted within 30 days after the end of the semester *or*
- Regularly disruptive behavior interferes with the functioning of the class *or*
- More than two absences

**Academic Honesty:**

All students are expected to respect the highest standards of academic integrity. The Graduate School considers it a violation of the requirements of intellectual responsibility to submit work that is not one's own or otherwise to subvert the conditions under which academic work is performed by oneself or by others. Violation may lead to failing a course, academic probation, or in repeated cases, suspension or expulsion.

**To access full text documents from the PEP links, you'll need to first log into your PEP account.**

### **Assigned Readings**

#### **Class 1: Origins of Psychoanalysis, Exorcism and Magnetism: Gassner & Mesmer**

Ellenberger, H. (1970). The emergence of dynamic psychiatry. In *The discovery of the unconscious: The history and evolution of dynamic psychiatry* (pp.53-109). Basic Books.

Midelfort, H. (2005). Healing. In *Exorcism and enlightenment: Johann Joseph Gassner and the demons of eighteenth-century Germany* (pp.59-86). Yale University Press.

#### **Class 2: Origins of Psychoanalysis, Trance to Transference: Puysegur & Breuer**

Crabtree, A. (1993). Puysegur and the discovery of magnetic sleep. In *From Mesmer to Freud: Magnetic sleep and the roots of psychological healing* (pp.38-53). Yale University Press.

Gilhooley, D., & Toich, F. (2020). The birth of psychoanalysis: From trance to transference. In *Psychoanalysis, intersubjective writing, and a postmaterialist model of mind: I woke up dead* (pp.179-190). Routledge.

#### **Class 3: Freud and the Classical Intrapsychic Tradition**

Freud, S. (1958). Remembering, repeating and working-through. In J. Strachey (Ed. and Trans.), *The standard edition of the complete psychological works of Sigmund Freud* (Vol.12, pp.147-156). Hogarth Press. (Original work published 1914)

<http://www.pep-web.org/document.php?id=se.012.0145a#p0145>

Freud, S. (1958). Observations on transference-love. In J. Strachey (Ed. and Trans.), *The standard edition of the complete psychological works of Sigmund Freud* (Vol. 12, pp. 159-171). Hogarth Press. (Original work published 1915)

<http://www.pep-web.org/document.php?id=se.012.0157a#p0157>

Mitchell, S., & Black, M. (1995). Sigmund Freud and the classical psychoanalytic tradition. In *Freud and beyond: A history of modern psychoanalytic thought* (pp. 1-22). Basic Books.

#### **Class 4: Freud's Disciples: Abraham, Rank & Reik**

Abraham, K. (1925). The influence of oral erotism in character-formation. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 6, 247-258.

<http://www.pep-web.org/document.php?id=ijp.006.0247a>

Rank, O. (1924). The trauma of birth in its importance for psychoanalytic therapy. *Psychoanalytic Review*, 11(3), 241-245.

<http://www.pep-web.org/document.php?id=psar.011.0241a>

Reik, T. (1933). New ways in psychoanalytic technique. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 14, 321-334.

<http://www.pep-web.org/document.php?id=ijp.014.0321a>

### **Class 5: Ferenczi & Groddeck: Trauma and Psychosomatic Conditions**

- Bergmann, M. (1996). The tragic encounter between Freud and Ferenczi and its impact on the history of psychoanalysis. In P. Rudnytsky, A. Bokay & P. Giampieri-Deutsch (Eds.), *Ferenczi's turn in psychoanalysis* (pp.145-159). New York University Press.
- Ferenczi, S. (1933/1949). Confusion of the tongues between the adults and the child—(The language of tenderness and of passion). *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 30, 225-230.  
<http://www.pep-web.org/document.php?id=ijp.030.0225a>
- Fortune, C. (2015). Georg Groddeck's influence on Sandor Ferenczi. In A. Harris & S. Kuchuck (Eds.), *The legacy of Sandor Ferenczi: From ghost to ancestor* (pp.96-110). Routledge.

### **Class 6: Ferenczi's Experiment in Mutual Analysis: Birth of the Relational Tradition**

- Dupont, J. (Ed.) (1988). *The clinical diary of Sandor Ferenczi* (selections). Harvard University Press.
- Fortune, C. (1993). The case of RN: Sandor Ferenczi's radical experiment in psychoanalysis. L. Aron & A. Harris (Eds.), *The legacy of Sandor Ferenczi* (pp. 101-120). The Analytic Press.
- Rachman, A. (2015). Elizabeth Severn: Sandor Ferenczi's analyst and collaborator in the study and treatment of trauma. In A. Harris & S. Kuchuck (Eds.), *The legacy of Sandor Ferenczi: From ghost to ancestor* (pp.111-126). Routledge.

### **Class 7: The Hungarian School and the development of American Psychoanalysis**

- Brennan, W. (2015). Out of the archive/unto the couch: Clara Thompson's analysis with Ferenczi. In A. Harris & S. Kuchuck (Eds.), *The legacy of Sandor Ferenczi: From ghost to ancestor* (pp.77-95). Routledge.
- Marshall, R. (2015). The influence of Hungarian analysts on Hyman Spotnitz and the modern psychoanalytic school. *Modern Psychoanalysis*, 40(1), 1-35.  
<http://www.pep-web.org/document.php?id=mpsa.040.0001a>

### **Class 8: Klein, Fairbairn and Development of Object Relations**

- Fairbairn, W. R. D. (1958). On the nature and aims of psycho-analytical treatment. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 39, 374-385.  
<http://www.pep-web.org/document.php?id=ijp.039.0374a>
- Klein, M. (1958). On the development of mental functioning. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 39, 84-90.  
<http://www.pep-web.org/document.php?id=ijp.039.0084a>
- Mitchell, S. (1994). The origin and nature of the "object" in the theories of Klein and Fairbairn. J. Grotstein & D. Rinsley (Eds.), *Fairbairn and the origins of object relations* (pp.66-87). Guilford Press.

### **Class 9: British Object Relations: Little, Sandler & Winnicott**

Little, M. (1951). Counter-transference and the patient's response to it. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 32, 32-40.

<http://www.pep-web.org/document.php?id=ijp.032.0032a>

Mitchell, S., & Black, M. (1995). The British object relations school: W.R.D. Fairbairn and D.W. Winnicott. In *Freud and beyond: A history of modern psychoanalytic thought* (pp. 112-138). Basic Books.

Sandler, J., & Sandler, A. (1998). On the psychoanalytic theory of motivation. In *Internal objects revisited* (pp. 1-26). International Universities Press.

Winnicott, D. W. (1969). The use of an object. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 50, 711-716.

<http://www.pep-web.org/document.php?id=ijp.050.0711a>

### **Class 10: American Object Relations: Bollas, Kernberg & Ogden**

Bollas, C. (2009). Caroline. In *The infinite question* (pp. 55-74). Routledge.

Kernberg, O. (1993). Convergences and divergences in contemporary psychoanalytic technique. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 74, 659-673.

<http://www.pep-web.org/document.php?id=ijp.074.0659a>

Ogden, T. (1983). The concept of internal object relations. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 64, 227-241.

<http://www.pep-web.org/document.php?id=ijp.064.0227a>

### **Class 11: Kleinians: Bion & Rosenfeld**

Bion, W. (1959). Attacks on linking. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 40, 308-315.

<http://www.pep-web.org/document.php?id=ijp.040.0308a>

Mitchell, S., & Black, M. (1995). Melanie Klein and contemporary Kleinian theory. In *Freud and beyond: A history of modern psychoanalytic thought* (pp. 85-111). Basic Books.

Rosenfeld, H. (1971). A clinical approach to the psychoanalytic theory of life and death instincts: An investigation into the aggressive aspects of narcissism. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 52, 169-178.

<http://www.pep-web.org/document.php?id=ijp.052.0169a>

### **Class 12: Contemporary Kleinians: Joseph, Steiner & Ogden**

Joseph, B. (1989). Psychic change and the psychoanalytic process. In M. Feldman & E. Spillius (Eds.), *Psychic equilibrium and psychic change: Selected papers of Betty Joseph* (pp. 192-202). Brunner-Routledge.

<http://www.pep-web.org/document.php?id=nlp.009.0001a#p0192>

Ogden, T. (1979). On projective identification. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 60, 357-373.

<http://www.pep-web.org/document.php?id=ijp.060.0357a>

Steiner, J. (1997). The interplay between pathological organizations and the paranoid-schizoid and depressive positions. In R. Schafer (Ed.), *The contemporary Kleinians of London* (pp. 193-219). International Universities Press.